



Appendix 3: Swimming in Shrewsbury Project – Assessment of Positives and Negatives for each Option

1. Options Considered

PROVISION	QUARRY				SUNDORNE			
	OPTION 1	OPTION 2	OPTION 3	OPTION 4	OPTION 1	OPTION 2	OPTION 3	OPTION 4
25m x 8 lane competition pool	X					X	X	X
15 x 8 m teaching pool with moveable floor	X							
17m x 10m Learner Pool						X	X	X
Leisure water – compact flume and small water space, splash pad	X							
Leisure water – large water space, fun pool, toddler area, beach area, splash pad/geysers, compact flume		X	X	X				
Temporary Pool During Construction					X			
20m x10m Community Pool		X						
25m x 4m Lane Training Pool with moveable floor for lessons			X	X				
Function room (100 people)	X	X	X	X				
Bistro (50 covers), Café (50 covers)	X	X	X	X				
Children's Soft Play	X	X	X	X				
Fitness Stations (80)	X	X	X	X				
2 x Studios	X	X	X	X				
Fitness Offer Improved						X	X	X
Increased Commercial Offer: Spa, Adventure Play				X				

Positives and Negatives for Each Option

Option 1

Positives

- Continuity of competition facilities in the town centre
- Ease of access for residents within Shrewsbury
- Wide variety of facilities for swimmers of all standards
- Provision of a temporary competition pool at Sundorne Sports Village has a low impact on the current facility which will not impede the operation of Sundorne Sports Village
- Relatively short construction time which can be accommodated during design development stages for the Quarry
Enables competition swimming to be consistently provided in Shrewsbury whilst the Quarry is upgraded
- Lowest amount of indicative capital investment required.
- Provides an indicative second highest operational surplus.

Negatives

- Additional cost of constructing the temporary swimming facilities at Sundorne Sports Village for the duration of the construction at the Quarry.
- No long-term improvements to Sundorne Sports Village Facilities
- Capital cost of the temporary pool at the Sports Village cannot be recuperated through operational revenue as the facility will not be open long enough to realise any such benefits
- Provision of a temporary pool at the Sundorne Sports Village is a relatively unsustainable solution as unnecessary embodied carbon will be utilised in the construction process and the building will be unlikely to contribute positively to its environment whilst operational and will need dismantling after use
- Negotiations with the Football Foundation, Big Lottery and Shropshire Community Leisure Trust will be necessary reference their interest in the Lease at Sundorne Sports Village
- Access to the Quarry site for large vehicles is highly constrained which may cause problems when competitions are held
- Parking at the Quarry site is limited which is not ideal for a competition facility
- Leisure water is limited in size due to the size of other facilities

- The size of swimming facilities requires a very large built footprint which limits its capacity to enhance the surrounding public realm
- Size of facilities at the Quarry site is likely to limit the ability of the design to accommodate other commercial uses
- The inclusion of lifecycle costings and cost of capital repayment put the option into an overall deficit position, but this is the lowest amount across the 4 options.

Option 2

Positives

- Reduced water offering requires the smallest built footprint which allows the building more opportunity to positively contribute to the surrounding public realm
- Water offering based around family swimming is more in keeping with the setting beside the park
- Increased leisure water at the Quarry site provides a new attraction in the town centre and encourages footfall in and around the site.
- Not providing competition facilities at the Quarry site provides the opportunity to promote the site as part of the wider sustainable travel agenda within the Big Town Plan.
- Provision of a competition swimming pool and teaching pool at Sundorne Sports Village which will not largely impede the current operation of the facility
- Placement of competition facilities at Sundorne Sports Village which is accessible from across Shropshire and Shrewsbury.
- Placement of competition facilities at the Sports Village venue which is better equipped to deal with the parking implications of competition swimming. Any design will need to take account of the impact on current parking provision and opportunities to create additional spaces as appropriate.
- Creation of a new attraction at Sundorne Sports Village which may improve the fitness offering and thus make the facility more popular
No disturbance to the existing facilities at the Sports Village such as team change and the academy
- Second lowest indicative capital investment requirement
- This option provides the highest indicative net operational surplus.

Negatives

- Reduced water offering at the Quarry site provides the most limited swimming facilities and may reduce the number and variety of users and negative reaction from some user groups
- Does not address concerns expressed in the previous public consultation exercise regarding the lack of a 25m pool at the Quarry site.
- A new swimming pool at Sundorne Sports Village further elongates the main building creating a long circulatory route
- New fitness facilities at Sundorne Sports Village cannot be accommodated adjacent to the changing block without building on top of the pool and therefore the fitness improvements would need to be made within the existing building
- Excavation would be required to accommodate the plant room for the new pool at Sundorne Sports Village
- Separate facilities at the Sports Village may create operational challenges and will be less efficient than facilities integrated with the existing infrastructure. More detailed design work is required to review the layout and mitigate for this.
- Negotiations with the Football Foundation, Big Lottery and Shropshire Community Leisure Trust will be necessary reference their interest in the Lease at the Sports Village
- Lifecycle costings and the cost of capital repayment put the option into a higher overall indicative deficit position than option 1

Option 3

Positives

- Versatile water offering providing for training and leisure swimming opportunities at the Quarry site
- Leisure water based around family swimming is more in keeping with the setting beside the park
- Increased leisure water at the Quarry site provides a new attraction in the town centre and encourages footfall in and around the site
- Not providing competition facilities at the Quarry site provides the opportunity to promote this site as part of the wider sustainable travel agenda within the Big Town Plan.
- A 25m x 4 lane pool with moveable floor at the Quarry site provides opportunities for club training, lane swimming and provision of swimming lessons in the town centre with minimal impact on the spatial requirements for the overall wet leisure offering.
- The provision of a 25m pool at the Quarry site responds to concerns expressed in the previous public consultation exercise regarding the continued provision of a 25m pool in the town centre

- Provision of a separate competition swimming pool and teaching pool at Sundorne Sports Village which will not largely impede the current operation of the facility
- Placement of competition facilities at Sundorne Sports Village which is accessible from across Shropshire and Shrewsbury
- Placement of competition facilities at the Sports Village venue which is better equipped to deal with the parking implications of competition swimming. Any design will need to take account of the impact on current parking provision and opportunities to create additional spaces as appropriate.
- Creation of a new attraction at Sundorne Sports Village which may improve the fitness offering and thus make the facility more popular
- No disturbance to the existing facilities at the Sports Village such as team changing and the academy.
- The additional capital investment to provide a more flexible swimming offer, including a 25metre training pool at the Quarry site is not significant when compared with the capital investment required for option 2

Negatives

- A new, separate swimming pool, at Sundorne Sports Village elongates the main building creating a long circulatory route
- New fitness facilities at Sundorne Sports Village cannot be accommodated adjacent to the changing block without building on top of the pool and therefore the fitness improvements would need to be made within the existing building
- Excavation would be required to accommodate the plant room at Sundorne Sports Village.
- Separate facilities at the Sports Village may create operational challenges and will be less efficient than facilities integrated with the existing infrastructure. More detailed design work is required to review the layout and mitigate for this.
- Negotiations with the Football Foundation, Big Lottery and Shropshire Community Leisure Trust will be necessary reference their interest in the Lease at Sundorne Sports Village
- This option provides an indicative net operational surplus, but it is lower than options 1 and 2.
- Lifecycle costings and the cost of capital repayment put the option into a higher indicative overall deficit position than option 1 and 2.

Option 4

Positives

- Versatile water offering providing for training and leisure swimming opportunities at the Quarry site
- Leisure water based around family swimming is more in keeping with the setting beside the park
- Increased leisure water at the Quarry site provides a new attraction in the town centre and encourages foot fall in and around the site
- Not providing competition facilities at the Quarry site provides the opportunity to promote this site as part of the wider sustainable travel agenda within the Big Town Plan.
- A 25m x 4 lane pool with moveable floor at the Quarry site provides opportunities for club training, lane swimming and provision of swimming lessons in the town centre with minimal impact on the spatial requirements for the wet leisure offering.
- The provision of a 25m pool at the Quarry site responds to concerns expressed in the previous public consultation exercise regarding the continued provision of a 25m pool in the town centre.
- Additional facilities provide the potential for customers to extend their visit to the facility thus increasing the likelihood of revenue generation and improved operational financial efficiency
- The inclusion of other commercial opportunities at the Quarry site has the potential to contribute to the overall affordability of the project.
- Provision of a separate competition swimming pool at Sundorne Sports Village which will not largely impede the current operation of the facility
- Placement of competition facilities at Sundorne Sports Village which is accessible from across Shropshire and Shrewsbury
- Placement of competition facilities at the Sports Village venue which is better equipped to deal with the parking implications of competition swimming. Any design will need to take account of the impact on current parking provision and opportunities to create additional spaces as appropriate.
- Creation of a new attraction at Sundorne Sports Village which may improve the fitness offering and thus make the facility more popular
- No disturbance to the existing facilities at the Sports Village such as team change and the academy.

Negatives

- Additional commercial uses at the Quarry site will increase the overall area of the facility and therefore the amount of capital investment required for design & construction. Further due diligence work on the financial appraisal of the project and the ability of potential commercial uses to contribute to the overall affordability of the project will be required.
- Additional uses may require multiple stakeholders with different operational models which will need to be considered as part of the

detailed design and management considerations.

- A new, separate swimming pool, at Sundorne Sports Village elongates the main building creating a long circulatory route
- New fitness facilities at Sundorne Sports Village cannot be accommodated adjacent to the changing block without building on top of the pool and therefore the fitness improvements would need to be made within the existing building
- Excavation would be required to accommodate the plant room at Sundorne Sports Village.
- Separate facilities at the Sports Village may create operational challenges and will be less efficient than facilities integrated with the existing infrastructure. More detailed design work is required to review the layout and mitigate for this.
- Negotiations with the Football Foundation, Big Lottery and Shropshire Community Leisure Trust will be necessary reference their interest in the Lease at Sundorne Sports Village
- This scheme requires the highest indicative capital investment
- Lifecycle costings and the cost of capital repayment put the option into a higher overall indicative deficit position than option 1, 2 and 3.